

2020

EXCERPT FROM “MASSACHUSETTS IN THE WOMAN SUFFRAGE MOVEMENT: REVOLUTIONARY REFORMERS”

Barbara Berenson

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.law.wne.edu/lawreview>

Recommended Citation

Barbara Berenson, *EXCERPT FROM “MASSACHUSETTS IN THE WOMAN SUFFRAGE MOVEMENT: REVOLUTIONARY REFORMERS”*, 42 W. New Eng. L. Rev. 359 (2020), <https://digitalcommons.law.wne.edu/lawreview/vol42/iss3/3>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Law Review & Student Publications at Digital Commons @ Western New England University School of Law. It has been accepted for inclusion in Western New England Law Review by an authorized editor of Digital Commons @ Western New England University School of Law. For more information, please contact pnewcombe@law.wne.edu.

WESTERN NEW ENGLAND LAW REVIEW

Volume 42

2020

Issue 3

EXCERPT FROM “MASSACHUSETTS IN THE WOMAN SUFFRAGE MOVEMENT: REVOLUTIONARY REFORMERS”

BARBARA BERENSON*

INTRODUCTION

In *Massachusetts in the Woman Suffrage Movement: Revolutionary Reformers*, I tell the story of the courageous and visionary activists who fought tenaciously for nearly a century to secure women the vote. The book balances the national and state stories. Massachusetts played a critical leadership role in the national campaign: among other things, it was the site of the first national woman’s rights convention, the headquarters of the American Woman Suffrage Association, and the home of the *Woman’s Journal*, the nation’s leading pro-suffrage newspaper. Until the final years of the movement, suffragists waged a state-based campaign: they sought to persuade states to amend their constitutions to enfranchise women and thereby ensure that critical number of representatives and senators in the United States Congress would be beholden to women voters. Only then, they predicted correctly, would an amendment to the United States Constitution be proposed and ratified. Analyzing the hard-fought state campaigns waged in Massachusetts offers a window into the particular challenges the suffrage movement faced in northeastern states as they urbanized and industrialized in the decades after the Civil War.

Chapters 7 and 8, excerpted here, explore the many changes in the suffrage campaign as the Gilded Age gave way to the Progressive Era at the start of the twentieth century. College women reenergized the

* Barbara Berenson is a lawyer and historian. She is a clinical instructor at Harvard Law School and previously worked as a senior attorney at the Massachusetts Supreme Judicial Court. In addition to *Massachusetts in the Woman Suffrage Movement: Revolutionary Reformers*, she is the author of *Boston in the Civil War: Hub of the Second Revolution* (2014) and co-editor of *Breaking Barriers: The Unfinished Story of Women Lawyers and Judges in Massachusetts* (2012).

movement. They experimented with new high-profile campaign tactics, including parades, to attract attention and sway public opinion. Wealthy society women donated urgently needed funds; their involvement also led mainstream newspapers to give more respectful coverage to the suffrage movement. Laboring women, many of them Irish, Italian, or Jewish immigrants, realized the ballot was the best tool to secure wage, hour, and safety reforms. Largely left out, however, were African-American women, as suffrage leaders courted the support of white Southerners determined to perpetuate race-based laws restricting access to the ballot. African-American women created their own organizations to fight for voting rights and against racism.

The nation's small number of women lawyers were well-represented among suffrage leaders. This excerpt introduces two Massachusetts women who broke barriers. Teresa Crowley studied law on her own after working as a secretary at a law firm. She became a prominent suffrage orator and organizer, and spearheaded the defeats of several leading anti-suffrage politicians. Utilizing her legislative research skills, she compiled and published the conservative voting records of these incumbents, which helped to persuade reform-minded voters to vote for change. Incumbents facing pro-suffrage opponents began to climb onto the suffrage bandwagon.

Jennie Loitman Barron, the daughter of Russian Jewish immigrants, graduated from Boston University School of Law, where she founded the Boston University Equal Suffrage League. Another prominent orator, she campaigned tirelessly for suffrage, particularly in urban, immigrant neighborhoods. After the Nineteenth Amendment was adopted, Barron led the Massachusetts campaign to permit women to serve on juries. (This campaign took three decades.) In 1937, Barron was appointed as an associate justice of the Boston Municipal Court. In 1957, she was the first woman appointed a justice of the Massachusetts Superior Court.

Examining the woman suffrage movement sheds light on a significant and little understood movement in American history. It also offers important lessons for the present, as both voting rights and women's rights are under renewed attacks. Against long odds, suffrage advocates waged a persistent battle for the ballot. Despite fierce backlash, they eventually prevailed. Their example inspires us to continue the fight to secure equal rights for all.

CHAPTER 7 NEW ALLIANCES

As the twentieth century dawned, inventive leaders in Massachusetts revitalized the state's suffrage movement by attracting new constituencies, forming new alliances, and experimenting with new tactics.¹ Exploring suffrage from the perspective of this one state reveals both the progress and challenges in the movement in a northeastern state that had rapidly urbanized and industrialized. Studying Massachusetts also advances our understanding of the national movement. As the *Woman's Journal* and NAWSA publicized and endorsed state innovations—and as leading suffragists continued to tirelessly crisscross the nation—NAWSA itself became larger, more diverse (albeit still white), and more influential.

A brief snapshot of Massachusetts at the turn of the century provides helpful context to examine changes in the suffrage movement.² In 1870, the Bay State's population was almost 1.5 million. Thirty years later, the population had nearly doubled to 2.8 million. In 1900, more than half the state's population were immigrants or their children; in Boston, the figure approached 75 percent. The vast majority of immigrants arriving between 1840 and 1880 were Irish. Toward the end of the century, Italians and Eastern Europeans flocked to the state, where they clustered in urban ethnic enclaves. By 1900, roughly four percent of the state's population had been born in Italy and over five percent in Russia (of whom half were Jewish). During these years of explosive growth, the African American population of remained small, amounting to under two percent.

In the early twentieth century, Massachusetts was the most urban state in the nation; fully three-quarters of its residents lived in cities, and fewer than ten percent of the state's labor force worked in agriculture in 1910. In addition to Boston, large industrial cities included Fall River, Lowell, Springfield, and Worcester. Three-quarters of factory workers were first- or second-generation Americans. Cities teemed with impoverished immigrants who lived in crowded tenements and worked under harsh conditions in factories that manufactured textiles, shoes, and other products. Many worked in construction and in quarries. Increasing

1. New tactics is the subject of the next chapter.

2. Statistics in this section are from: United States Census Bureau; Tager, Jack and Wilke, Richard W. eds. *Historical Atlas of Massachusetts* (Univ. of Mass., 1991) at 34-39, 68, 82; Matthews, 11, 15, 49, 99; Traister, Rebecca. *All the Single Ladies: Unmarried Women and the Rise of an Independent Nation* (Simon & Schuster 2016) at 47; Srole, Carole. *The Feminization of Clerical Work, Boston, 1860-1915* (PhD thesis, 1884); Blair, Karen J. *The Clubwoman as Feminist: True Womanhood Redefined, 1868 – 1914* (Holmes & Meier, 1980).

numbers of workers unionized as they sought relief from low wages, long hours, and dangerous machines and conditions. When financial circumstances required, immigrant women and children labored in garment factories or laundries or worked in domestic service.

Life had also changed for white, native-born women of the working- and lower-middle classes who were no longer isolated on family farms. A complex urban economy – and inventions such as the typewriter, telephone and department store -- led to a demand for women to fill positions as typists, bookkeepers, telephone operators, and sales clerks. Women constituted 3.1 percent of clerical workers in 1870, but nearly 30 percent by 1900. By 1920, 92 percent of stenographers were female. Work for these women was largely a temporary status, however, that ended with marriage. Nearly 90 percent of the female work force were single and another four percent were widows.

Young women from more privileged backgrounds enjoyed new opportunities. In 1870, fewer than 14,000 American women had been enrolled in higher education; in 1900, that figure was over 85,000, which represented one-third of all students. Over half of these young women were enrolled in teacher-training schools. Teaching remained one of the few socially acceptable vocations for single middle-class women, and three-quarters of primary school teachers were women. Daughters of the upper class and the growing professional class might attend one of the Seven Sisters colleges, four of which (Mount Holyoke, Radcliffe, Smith and Wellesley) were located in Massachusetts, or a coeducational university such as Boston University, which opened in 1872. These colleges offered women the same liberal arts education available to men. Most women college graduates left the work force at marriage (or married while in school and never entered the work force), but some worked after marriage, some delayed marriage, and others remained single. Small numbers of women became doctors, journalists, ministers, or lawyers – the professional field most associated with public life.

Opportunities for independence and mobility opened up. The nationwide bicycle craze of the 1890s impacted young women to such an extent that Anthony observed in 1896 that the bicycle was doing “more to emancipate women than anything else in the world.”³ Women who rode bicycles experienced the independence of transporting themselves and the energizing effects of exercise. The bicycle led to clothing reforms, as young women spurned confining corsets and ballooning skirts.

3. New York World, 2-February-1896.

Streetlights, trolleys, subways, and elevated rails contributed to the ability of city-dwelling women to move about safely and independently.

Life also changed for economically secure married women. They had fewer children; the birthrate for white women fell from five in 1860 to 3.5 in 1910. Economically advantaged women had access to inexpensive domestic help (provided by African American or immigrant women), store-bought goods, and new labor-saving home appliances. As a result, these women often had leisure hours to devote to women's clubs. While many club women focused on self-education and self-improvement, others looked outward for ways to provide the "municipal housekeeping" needed to clean up, or at least ameliorate, the harsh conditions caused by overcrowded cities and urban poverty. The Massachusetts Federation of Women's Clubs was founded in 1893, and by 1900 more than 8000 Massachusetts women belonged to over 55 women's clubs.

Activists from Massachusetts took advantage of the new circumstances to found organizations that broadened and strengthened the woman suffrage movement across the social spectrum, attracting not only college students and alumnae but also working-class women. From these two prongs of development emerged important new leaders.

A. *College Women*

"I sat on the floor in [the head mistress's] little room [at boarding school] and indignantly denied in my own mind all that she was saying, by way of advice to the seniors, about the duty of a wife to realize that the husband should be considered the head of the household . . . I was certain that she was wrong; for why should a woman be subordinate?"⁴

This moment sparked Maud Wood Park's lifelong commitment to women's rights. The daughter of a Boston police officer, she attended boarding school in Albany, New York, graduating as class valedictorian in 1887. Following the same path as many earlier reformers, she taught school for eight years while saving money for college. Like them too, she had boundless energy. In a personal reflection composed in 1903, she wrote that she had "ambitions enough for Shakespeare and Julius Caesar and Cleopatra and Napoleon rolled into one."⁵

4. Maud Wood Park Papers Pa-9, WRC-SL.

5. Maud Wood Park, "Who I Am and What I Believe," MWP Papers, LOC, collected in Melanie Gustafson, "Maud Wood Park Archive: The Power of Organization, Part One: Maud Wood Park and the Woman Suffrage Movement," part of Kathryn Kish Sklar and Thomas

Park entered Radcliffe College in 1895, married architect Charles E. Park while a student, and graduated in three years. She voted in a school committee election before college, but was “unaware or neglectful” of the Massachusetts 1895 municipal suffrage referendum. Perhaps motivated by that referendum, one of her English professors assigned students to write an essay on woman suffrage. Out of 70 students, Park was one of two who wrote in support. She declared, “I see no more reason for the men of my family to decide my political opinions and express them for me at the polls than to choose my hats and wear them, or my religious faith and occupy my seat in church.” She found it “obvious” that one of two logical arguments should prevail. If women are the same as men for voting purposes, then women have the same need to vote as men. If women are different from men for voting purposes, then their different interests and points of view must be represented.⁶

But many college women in Massachusetts did not share Park’s views. Agnes Irwin, the dean of Radcliffe from 1894 to 1909, was a prominent anti-suffragist (as was Harvard University president Charles Eliot). Mount Holyoke had conducted a straw poll at the time of the state’s 1895 referendum; only 300 of 1,000 students participated, 114 of whom supported woman suffrage.⁷

After the Massachusetts Association Opposed to the Further Extension of Suffrage to Woman hosted an anti-suffrage speaker at Radcliffe, Park and a like-minded classmate, Inez Haynes, invited Alice Stone Blackwell to speak on campus.⁸ This event, Park later recalled, “began the link that bound me to suffrage work for more than twenty years.” Stone Blackwell invited Park to speak at MWSA’s annual dinner and then before the Judiciary Committee of the Massachusetts Legislature. Her abilities impressed many veterans of the Massachusetts suffrage movement, including Mary Hutcheson Page, who had an outstanding ability to identify and recruit future leaders. Page was then serving as both chair of MWSA’s Executive Board and president of the Brookline Woman Suffrage Association. Born in Ohio in 1860, she had enrolled as a special

Dublin, eds., *Women and Social Movements in the United States, 1600 – 2000* (hereafter, Park in Gustafson).

6. Park, Pa-9, Folder 002690-047-001, WRC-SL.

7. Marzacco, Patricia. *The Obligation of Opportunity: Maud Wood Park, The College Equal Suffrage League, and the Response of Women Students in Massachusetts Colleges, 1900 – 1920* (PhD, 2004) at 84-85.

8. She was known as Inez Haynes Gillmore after her first marriage. Following divorce and remarriage, she used the name Inez Haynes Irwin, though often published as Inez Haynes Gillmore.

student at MIT before marrying and having four children. In the discouraging years after the 1895 referendum, Park later reflected, “only the courage of Alice Stone Blackwell and the energy of Mary Hutcheson” had kept MWSA going. The small number of remaining MWSA members had “occasional tea meetings” in their offices on the second floor of an old house on Park Street.⁹

At Stone Blackwell’s urging, Park attended NAWSA’s convention in Washington, D.C., in 1900. She was dismayed to find that “[the first session] was held in the dreary basement vestry of a Washington church” with an audience of “about a hundred women, mostly middle-aged or elderly.” When the state president from Missouri presented her report in verse, adjusting her pronunciation of the state’s name to force rhymes, Park “became almost hysterical with suppressed laughter.” Clearly, the national movement was in desperate need of a shake-up. Park decided to rescue the suffrage movement from what she called “the doldrums.” Her weapon would be other college-educated women. She believed her peers owed a debt, which she called the “obligation of opportunity,” to earlier women’s rights activists whose efforts had made higher education and other opportunities available.¹⁰

Park and Inez Haynes co-founded the College Equal Suffrage League (CESL) in 1900. Park served as president and Haynes as corresponding secretary. The initial membership of twenty-five was drawn from alumnae of local colleges, including Radcliffe, Wellesley, and Boston University. The CESL’s mission was to promote support for suffrage among alumnae and students and, nearly as important, to defeat indifference. Park found it “unthinkable that women who have learned to act for themselves in college and had their minds awakened to civic duties should not care for the ballot to enforce their wishes.” She also lacked patience with those who felt they did not need the ballot because their own wishes were well met. “I think the majority of women do not realize how selfish, how unkind, this is,” she commented. “It is as if a hungry woman had asked for food and another, more fortunate woman, had said to her, ‘I will not give it to you because I have had a good breakfast and have all the food I want.’”¹¹

The members of the CESL generated interest by holding regular meetings, sponsoring speeches and debates, circulating literature,

9. WJ article, 25-April-1914; Park, Folders Pa-9, Pa-175, Pa-137, 002690-047-0001, WRC-SL; Mary Hutcheson Page Papers, Folder 653-653b, WRC-SL.

10. Id.

11. Park, Folder 002690-047-0001, WRC-SL.

organizing essay contests, and writing for college newspapers. The *Woman's Journal* helped by extensively publicizing CESL's efforts. Attuned to the boost that the young, educated women could provide to the suffrage movement's image, Stone Blackwell wrote, "A pleasant fact is that most of the officers of the new League are remarkable not only for brains but for beauty, and beauty of a distinctively feminine type. There is not a mannish-looking woman among them."¹²

The CESL's membership grew rapidly. By 1906, there were more than 250 members, and by 1913, more than 450 women were members of the Massachusetts branch. Many students remained resistant or indifferent, however. Wellesley College conducted a poll to ascertain students' views in 1911. Only 293 students supported enfranchising women, while 557 were opposed and 528 did not participate.¹³

Showing the same resolve as the suffrage pioneers, Park tirelessly traversed the nation, encouraging the formation of new leagues of college students and alumnae. In 1905, she attended NAWSA's convention in Oregon, and then traveled to Colorado, Idaho, Utah, and Wyoming to investigate the "practical working" of woman suffrage in the four states that already adopted it. (Woman suffrage had returned to Utah in 1896 when it was admitted to statehood.) She returned with letters from numerous political and civic leaders praising the intelligence and morality of women voters. She used these to rebut the claims of suffrage opponents that political equality for women had been a "disaster" in the states where it existed.¹⁴

Park seldom confided the pressures she faced, but a letter from February 1906 reveals her burdens. She wrote, "I'm behind with my work, which always makes me out of sorts, and today I'm really ill with what I fancy is tonsillitis, though I don't dare to have the doctor for fear she'll tell me to stay in bed." After describing her "frightful" upcoming schedule of speeches, she continued, "and today my throat is so bad that I can only whisper."¹⁵

The college movement proved so successful that NAWSA's 1906 annual convention in Baltimore included a College Evening featuring a representative from each of the "Seven Sister" schools. (In addition to the four Massachusetts colleges, the others were Barnard, Bryn Mawr, and Vassar.) Park delivered an address urging college students and alumnae to

12. WJ, 31-March-1900.

13. Marzzacco, 30.

14. Park, Folder 137, WRC-SL.

15. Id.

persuade other college-educated women to “realize their debt” to past activists and “make them understand that one of the ways to pay that debt is to fight the battle in the quarter of the field in which it is still unwon.” This convention also marked the final public appearance of Susan B Anthony, who told the young and energetic recruits, “Failure is impossible.”¹⁶

Delighted with the success of the CESL, NAWSA asked Park to organize leagues in additional states. In 1907, she temporarily moved to San Francisco to organize there and in the Midwest. She had been widowed in 1904, and she secretly married Robert Hunter, an actor and theatrical agent, in 1908. She shared the fact of her remarriage with only her closest confidantes, later explaining “my kind of work could be better done by a supposed widow than by a woman known to be married and therefore suspected of neglecting her husband.”¹⁷ Park’s decision is another reminder that prominent suffragists needed to be forever conscious of avoiding accusations that suffrage was incompatible with ordinary domestic life.

By 1908, fifteen states had CESL leagues. At that year’s NAWSA convention in Buffalo, New York, the CESL became a national organization. M. Carey Thomas, the pro-suffrage woman president of Bryn Mawr College, was elected president, and Park became second vice-president and chair of the organization committee. She left the country for the next two years, however. With financial support from Pauline Agassiz Shaw, a wealthy suffrage supporter from Massachusetts, Park travelled around the world with photographer Mabel Willard to study women in other countries. Park sent extensive reports that were published in the *Woman’s Journal* and contributed to keeping American women informed about women’s advances elsewhere. She returned to Massachusetts to resume suffrage work in 1910.

The CESL’s influence on the suffrage movement was considerable. In addition to providing new energy and skills, college women gave the movement, as Park acknowledged, “a kind of intellectual prestige that was needed.”¹⁸ College leagues also had a decisive practical impact. In California, for example, the San Francisco College League, which Park started in 1907, campaigned vigorously in the successful 1911 state suffrage campaign.

16. V HWS 171, 192-193.

17. Park in Gustafson.

18. Park, Folder Pa-175, WRC-SL.

The CESL was only one of the indefatigable Park's achievements. Starting in 1901, she led the new Boston Equal Suffrage Association for Good Government, which is discussed in the next chapter. It would transform the suffrage movement by piloting new campaign and outreach tactics.

B. *Working-Class Women*

While the CESL reached out to college women, other activists forged a cross-class, cross-ethnic, and cross-religious alliance with working-class women. Support for suffrage grew as working women became persuaded that the ballot was essential to goals such as limiting the hours worked by mothers and children in factories (without reducing pay), providing adequate urban sanitation, and ensuring safety of food and water.

The foundation for this successful coalition had been laid during the late nineteenth century. The Women's Educational and Industrial Union was founded by physician Harriet Clisby in Boston in 1877. She recruited a small group of well-to-do idealistic women to finance and manage this groundbreaking organization dedicated to offering charitable, educational, and vocational assistance to urban working-class women, the vast majority of them immigrants.

The settlement house movement of the late nineteenth century was crucial in connecting reformers to the state's immigrant communities. Though most often associated with Chicago, where Jane Addams opened the influential Hull House, the movement also flourished in Boston and other cities. Pauline Agassiz Shaw, the funder of Park's around-the-world travels, was among the most important settlement house backers. The daughter of Harvard professor Louis Agassiz and stepdaughter of Radcliffe co-founder Elizabeth Cary Agassiz, she was married to Quincy Adams Shaw, among the wealthiest men in Massachusetts.

As immigrants poured into the city, Shaw founded the North Bennett Street Industrial School and Civic House in Boston's North End in 1879. At these and other settlement houses, members of women's clubs and young college graduates joined forces to provide first- and second-generation Italian, Jewish, and Irish immigrants with job training, English-language skills, child care, health care, and other services. Settlement house work exposed privileged reformers to the practical concerns of wage-earning women.

The Women's Trade Union League, founded in 1903, represented a new stage in cross-class relations, as it brought together recently unionized women workers and wealthy philanthropists. Fittingly,

principal founders Mary Kenney O'Sullivan and Mary Morton Kimball Kehew had starkly different backgrounds. Kehew's maternal grandfather had been governor of Massachusetts, her father was a banker, and her husband was a wealthy oil merchant.

In contrast, O'Sullivan was born to Irish Catholic immigrants in Missouri in 1864. Starting at age 14, she worked at bookbinderies in Missouri, Iowa, and then Chicago. Convinced that women must organize to improve working conditions, she established a union of women bookbinders in Chicago. Unionizing working women was challenging work. Many of them eschewed unionization, as they anticipated quitting their jobs upon marriage. In 1888, less than two percent of the female work force was organized into trade unions.¹⁹ O'Sullivan's efforts were supported by Jane Addams, who offered the use of Hull House for labor meetings. Samuel Gompers, the first president of the American Federation of Labor (AFL), founded in 1886, hired O'Sullivan as the first national woman organizer in 1892. At this early stage, however, the AFL had little interest in working women and did not renew her contract.

Kehew invited O'Sullivan to Boston, where they discussed forming an alliance to press for higher wages and improved working conditions for women laborers. O'Sullivan also met her future husband on that visit and moved to Boston in 1894. She joined the board of the Women's Educational and Industrial Union, and with Kehew, founded an auxiliary Union for Industrial Progress to encourage trade unionism among women. O'Sullivan led or assisted unionization efforts among women bookbinders, laundresses, garment workers, rubber workers, and others. She and her family lived in the Denison Settlement House. She was widowed in 1902 when her husband, an AFL organizer and *Boston Globe* labor editor (and former streetcar driver), was killed in a streetcar accident.

The following year, O'Sullivan, Kehew, and several others decided to found a national organization to support trade unionism among women. The AFL was by then paying renewed attention to the potential strength that working women could bring to the labor movement, although it remained wary that women workers might exert downward pressure on wages. O'Sullivan announced the formation of the Women's Trade Union League (WTUL) at the AFL's national convention held in Boston's

19. Kenneally, James. *Women and American Trade Unions* (Eden Press 1981) at 18. The percentage of male industrialized workers who were unionized was similar, but the absolute number was far higher because of their greater participation in the work force. The percentage of the male labor force composed of union members would grow tremendously during the next several decades.

Faneuil Hall in November 1903.²⁰ The WTUL would be an umbrella organization of women's trade unions dedicated to supporting existing labor unions, aiding new ones to form, and advancing legislation to improve pay and working conditions. Reflecting its cross-class character, Kehew was elected national president and O'Sullivan became secretary and first vice-president. Local branches of the WTUL were quickly organized in Boston, Chicago, New York, and other cities.

O'Sullivan believed that all producing members of society have a natural right to vote, and that women's inability to vote was directly responsible for wage and other disparities between male and female workers. Though NAWSA had not historically sought common ground with working women, that now changed. Some influential suffragists, including Jane Addams and other supporters of the settlement house movement, agreed that wage-earning women urgently needed the ballot. These suffragists were eager to form a bridge connecting the suffrage and labor movements, and they criticized the suffrage movement's historic ethnic and class prejudices. Some in NAWSA substantively agreed, and others recognized the practical advantages of an alliance. In 1906, when NAWSA representatives made what had become their annual visit to Capitol Hill to speak before the Senate Committee on Woman Suffrage, Mary Kenney O'Sullivan was included among the small number of presenters.²¹

The WTUL established a suffrage department in 1908. NAWSA and the WTUL sent delegates to one another's national conventions, and the WTUL urged working women to participate in suffrage rallies. For working women who felt uncomfortable in the middle- and upper-class ambiance of NAWSA events, the WTUL established wage-earner suffrage leagues. NAWSA president Anna Howard Shaw hired leading labor organizer Rose Schneiderman to persuade working women of the necessity to vote. In a bow to the changing times, NAWSA ended its support of educational qualifications for voting in 1909.²²

Those in NAWSA who supported an alliance with working-class women typically additionally favored an alliance with working-class men who, of course, could demonstrate their support by voting for woman suffrage. O'Sullivan and the WTUL also helped strengthen that still-

20. Juravich, Thomas et al. *Commonwealth of Toil: Chapters in the History of Massachusetts Workers and Their Unions* (Univ. of Mass. 1996) at 87-89.

21. V HWS 189-191.

22. Kenneally, Id., 131; Keyssar, Alexander. *The Right to Vote: The Contested History of Democracy in the United States* (Basic Books 2000) at 164.

tentative connection between rank-and-file union men and the cause of woman suffrage. In a NAWSA pamphlet entitled *Why the Working Woman Needs the Vote*, O'Sullivan argued that women's votes would directly benefit working-class men. She explained that low wages for women exerted downward pressure on men's wages because an employer could hire an inexpensive woman laborer in place of a man. With the ballot, she contended, women would have the power to demand higher wages. She was also careful to stress that suffrage would not disturb ordinary domestic life. She explained that women's higher wages would not be a "hardship" for men because "the increase in the man's wages will give the family the large income needed, without its being necessary for so many women to work outside the home."²³

O'Sullivan's Catholicism also eased Catholics' historical distrust of the suffrage movement. Many male union members – nearly all Democrats and many of them Catholic -- believed that women would support such Progressive Era reforms as the campaign for an eight-hour day and a minimum wage. In 1907, AFL head Gompers told Anna Howard Shaw that his organization was committed to "equal suffrage, equal rights, and equal pay," and by 1909, 235 unions in Massachusetts had endorsed woman suffrage.²⁴ Thus, through its alliance with the WTUL, the woman suffrage movement was able finally to attract more working-class Democrats to its cause.

C. *African American Women*

Even before the turn-of-the-century focus on college and working women, Boston's African-American women had already moved in a new direction. In 1890, Josephine Ruffin had begun organizing Boston's black women to combat both gender- and race-based discrimination. At the time, she was a journalist writing for the *Courant*, a weekly paper serving Boston's black community. Her husband had died in 1886.

Ruffin decided to form a club for black women in Boston, though white women were not prohibited from joining. Her own civic involvements, including membership in the New England Women's Club, had given her firsthand knowledge of the way such clubs nurtured sisterhood and promoted good works. In 1893, Ruffin and her daughter, Florida Ruffin Ridley, a Boston schoolteacher, founded the Women's Era Club. By March 1894, over 100 black women had joined the club with

23. O'Sullivan, Mary Kenney. *Why the Working Women Needs the Vote*.

24. Kenneally, Id., 54; Strom, Sharon Hartman. *Political Woman: Florence Luscomb and the Legacy of Radical Reform* (Temple Univ. Press 2001) at 70.

the uplifting motto, "Help to make the world better." Club members were literate and largely drawn from families that held positions of influence within the local black community.²⁵

The following year, Ruffin, Ridley, and Maria Baldwin, a black school principal in Cambridge, founded the *Woman's Era*, a monthly newspaper. In the editors' opinion, the paper responded to the need for a "medium of intercourse and sympathy between the women of all races and conditions," but especially, "of the educated and refined, among the colored women, members of which class may be found in every state from Maine to Florida."²⁶

From the outset, the *Woman's Era* made clear that it would focus on race as well as gender. It supported black journalist Ida Wells Barnett's campaign against lynchings of black men in the South. It did not spare NAWSA from criticism, protesting the choice of Atlanta as a site for the 1895 convention and its acquiescence to the racist demands of white southerners.²⁷

Ruffin ambitiously decided to form a national federation of black women's clubs. To this end, the *Woman's Era* Club invited representatives from other black women's clubs to convene in Boston in July 1895. Approximately two hundred women from twenty clubs in ten states attended. The purpose of the convention was to address issues of "vital importance to us as women, but also the things that are of special interest to us as [black] women." Taking direct aim at those who claimed that black women were morally inferior to white women – a common accusation of white racists -- Ruffin announced that the Federation would teach "an ignorant and suspicious world that our aims and interests are identical with those of all good aspiring women."²⁸

Attendees founded the Federation of African-American Women, which following a subsequent merger, became the National Association of Colored Women, headed by Mary Church Terrell. (It later became the National Association of Colored Women Clubs (NACW).) Black women's clubs supported the suffrage movement, and the NACW established a Suffrage Department that educated members about the benefits of suffrage. Nevertheless, NAWSA did not welcome black clubs. Discriminatory racial attitudes continued to find widespread acceptance

25. Holden, Teresa Blue. *Earnest Women Can Do Anything: The Public Career of Josephine St. Pierre Ruffin, 1842 – 1904*. (Diss. 2005).

26. *Woman's Era*, March 1894.

27. *Woman's Era*, March, June, July, November 1894.

28. *Woman's Era*, August 1895.

within NAWSA. The “unwritten and largely unspoken NAWSA policy” on black suffragists was to ignore them, and “if pressed, refuse their allegiance and aid.”²⁹ The connection between race and gender discrimination remained severed.

Although the *Woman’s Era* ceased publication in 1897 following an unsuccessful appeal for financial support, and the Women’s Era Club disbanded in 1903, Ruffin remained an activist and community leader for the remainder of her life. She waged her own public battle against racism in the white women’s club movement. When the General Federation of Women’s Clubs, which had formed in 1890, held its 1900 meeting in Milwaukee that year, Ruffin was part of the Massachusetts state delegation. Her application to attend as the president of the Women’s Era Club had been accepted without Federation organizers realizing that it was a club of African American women. The Federation president, who was from Georgia, refused to seat Ruffin as a representative of the Women’s Era Club, but – seeking a quiet resolution -- offered instead to seat her as a delegate from either the Massachusetts Federation of Women’s Clubs or the New England Women’s Press Club. Ruffin refused to accept this substandard treatment. She was supported by the Massachusetts Federation, which urged the General Federation to admit women’s clubs regardless of members’ “race, creed, or politics.”³⁰ Two years later, the General Federation reached a compromise that gave each state federation authority over matters of membership.

Ruffin was a founding member of the Boston chapter of the NAACP in 1911. She continued to espouse the view that the struggles against racial and gender discrimination were linked, as they had been at their birth, and that each movement’s successes would benefit the other. But these sentiments found little support among NAWSA’s leaders. The efforts of black women suffragists remained part of a narrative of exclusion and separation.

CHAPTER 8 NEW TACTICS

Due to the extraordinary seed-sowing efforts of Maud Wood Park, Mary Kenney O’Sullivan, and their allies, Massachusetts suffragists regained the ground lost after the 1895 “sham referendum.” By 1908,

29. Graham, 23-25. There were some exceptions during state campaigns, however. NAWSA’s policy might be described as courting white southerners but courting black northerners during individual state campaigns. See Terborg-Penn at 92-105, 126.

30. WJ, 9-Feb.-1901, 16-June-1900.

MWSA claimed more than 100 local affiliates, and with nearly 20,000 members, more members than any state suffrage association except New York.³¹ The suffrage movement continued to adopt new tactics to broaden its appeal and visibility. Expanding beyond the lecture circuit and fundraising fair, activists moved “out of the parlor and into the streets” to reach new audiences.³²

The Boston Equal Suffrage Association for Good Government (BESAGG) was central to these new efforts. The indomitable trio of Maud Wood Park, Mary Hutcheson Page, and Pauline Agassiz Shaw founded this organization in 1901 in order to combine efforts to secure suffrage with direct activities for civic improvement. Park served as executive secretary, Page chaired the board and the membership committee, and Shaw financed the organization and held the honorary title of president. Soon after BESAGG’s formation, it became an auxiliary member of MWSA and admitted members residing from anywhere within the Greater Boston area. By 1910, BESAGG claimed 500 members.³³

The new organization established committees charged with addressing popular Progressive Era topics such as public school improvement, civic sanitation, the prevention of vice, and the care of the poor and disabled. Suffrage work quickly eclipsed other efforts, however. Park explained that members shared “[t]he conviction that in a democracy the conscientious use of the ballot is the most direct way in which to work for good government.”³⁴

Several factors likely ignited BESAGG’s decision to test new suffrage tactics. First were the activities of the English Women’s Social and Political Union (WSPU), which was founded by Emmeline Pankhurst in 1903. It engaged in such “militant” forms of protest as holding public street meetings, heckling speakers, and disrupting political meetings. The British press derogatorily dubbed WSPU members “suffragettes,” and they adopted this moniker. The American press covered WSPU activities extensively, particularly in 1908 when Pankhurst was arrested for the first time as she sought to deliver a petition to the Prime Minister. At her trial, she declared to the judge, “We are not here because we are law-breakers;

31. Strom, Sharon Hartman, “Leadership and Tactics in the American Woman Suffrage Movement: A New Perspective from Massachusetts,” 62 *Journal of American History* (Sept 1975) at 300.

32. See, e.g., McCammon, Holly, “Out of the Parlors and Into the Streets: The Changing Tactical Repertoire of the U.S. Women’s Suffrage Movements,” *Social Forces*, March 2003, 787.

33. Park, Folder 94, WRC-SL.

34. Park, Folder 95, WRC-SL.

we are here in our efforts to become law-makers.”³⁵ During the winter and spring of 1909, two English suffragettes visited Boston and discussed their use of open-air meetings to attract attention. Harriot Stanton Blatch in New York was also experimenting with open-air meetings, although her Equality League of Self-Supporting Women was essentially a working-class coalition, while BESAGG was largely composed of more privileged women.³⁶

Another factor was the success of an event that had taken place in the city of Lynn, Massachusetts, the previous September. Four members of the Lynn Equal Suffrage Association arrived in the center of town in an automobile, itself an eye-catching event. They were accompanied by musicians whose playing quickly attracted a crowd. Soon, the suffragists were addressing a spontaneously gathered audience of several hundred. In the *Woman's Journal*, Henry Blackwell enthused, “This very successful meeting opens up a new method of popularizing woman suffrage, well worthy of imitation. Not ten of that large audience could have been persuaded to enter a church or hall.”³⁷ At eighty-three, Blackwell was still an active suffragist, and he remained so until his death the following year.

BESAGG quickly adopted the tactic of open-air meetings. In the absence of Maud Wood Park, who was on her world tour, Susan Fitzgerald led the organization's initial open-air efforts. She had worked at a New York settlement house after her graduation from Bryn Mawr College. Upon moving to Boston in 1906, she threw her formidable energy into the both the suffrage and trade union campaigns. Page placed her at the helm of BESAGG.

Fitzgerald and three other suffragists held their first open-air meeting on Bedford's town common in June 1909. To publicize the event, they affixed large yellow posters in store windows and on signposts and telegraph poles in Bedford and nearby communities. An audience of nearly 100, the majority men, gathered as Fitzgerald stood on a wooden box and addressed passers-by. Her aides held Votes for Women signs and distributed leaflets.³⁸

Suffragists held similar events on Wednesdays and Saturdays throughout the summer. Though town commons were the usual

35. Pankhurst, Emmeline. *My Own Story* (1914) at 129. The English movement would later engage in a campaign that included window breaking and other forms of property damage.

36. DeBois, Ellen Carol. *Woman Suffrage & Women's Rights* (NYU Press 1998) at 195-199.

37. WJ, 19-September-1908.

38. Florence Luscomb Papers, Folder 635. WRC-SL.

destination, the suffragists “occasionally varied the program by going to the beaches or on special excursions where [they] could catch the holiday crowd.” Not surprisingly, the suffragists sometimes encountered resistance, but speakers responded with persistence and ingenuity. For example, when officials forbade suffragists from speaking on popular Nantasket Beach, they carried their Votes for Women banner into the water and “spoke from the sea to the audience on the shore.”³⁹

A. *Some New Campaigners*

Future leaders became involved through these new campaign efforts. Florence Luscomb, who had recently graduated from MIT with a degree in architecture, was born into an activist family in Worcester. When she was five, her mother took her to Washington, D.C., to hear Susan B. Anthony speak. At MIT, where she was one of twelve women in a student body of 1,200, Luscomb joined the College Equal Suffrage League and delivered speeches and distributed literature in support of suffrage. She attended the open-air meeting in Bedford, and made her open-air speaking debuts in the town of Dedham and the Hyde Park neighborhood of Boston. Her competition included “passing fire engines, elevated trains, hollering drunks and dog fights.”⁴⁰

Teresa Crowley, who was born in Wakefield in 1873, pursued an amateur career as an actress and worked as a secretary before marrying attorney John Crowley. After having three children, she became a lawyer. (Massachusetts had admitted its first woman lawyer to the bar in 1882.) She was recruited to the suffrage movement by Mary Hutcheson Page. Crowley began as a volunteer in BESAGG’s office, but soon became a commanding outdoor speaker. She appeared with Fitzgerald in Bedford. Historians have often identified Crowley as Irish-Catholic (her maiden name was O’Leary) but the evidence suggests otherwise. Crowley’s sister and grandson emphasized that Crowley’s mother was descended from “old colonial stock” and that her father, a successful businessman, was born in London. Her grandson reported that Crowley once wore orange (the color of Irish Protestants) to a gathering of Boston Irish Catholics, a mistake unlikely to be made by an Irish Catholic.⁴¹

Some of the notable newcomers were, however, the daughters of Jewish and Catholic immigrants, and they helped diversify the suffrage movement. Jennie Loitman Barron of Boston’s West End was the

39. Luscomb, Folder 635, WRC-SL. V HWS 276.

40. Luscomb, Folder 635, MC 394: Folder 212, WRC-SL.

41. Teresa O’Leary Crowley Papers, Folder 49, WRC-SL.

daughter of Russian Jewish immigrants committed to educating their four daughters. After graduating first in her class at Boston's Girls' High School, she entered Boston University in 1906 where she founded the Boston University Equal Suffrage League. Another pioneering lawyer, she continued her education at Boston University Law School. Barron later recalled campaigning for suffrage from soapboxes and open automobiles, while "at times dodging such missiles as stale eggs and overripe tomatoes."⁴²

Margaret Foley became a leader of efforts to reach out to working-class immigrants, especially Catholics. Born to a working-class, Irish-Catholic family in 1875, Foley attended public school in Dorchester. Her interest in woman suffrage began when "there was much talk at home about [her brother's] voting and future political affiliations," but her queries were met with laughter. In her teens, with a dream of a career as a music performer, she traveled to California, where she visited relatives while teaching gymnastics and swimming at resorts. Returning to Boston, she became a hat trimmer and joined the hat trimmers' union of the WTUL. She worked as a paid speaker and organizer for MWSA starting in 1906.⁴³

B. *Trolley Tours and New Outreach*

Elated by the interest demonstrated by audiences at open-air meetings, Fitzgerald organized a statewide "trolley tour" during August, 1909. Maintaining an exhausting pace, she and several others travelled west through northern towns and returned through southern towns.⁴⁴ Resting only on Sundays, the women delivered 97 speeches and reached an estimated 25,000 people. Luscomb described their modus operandi after arriving in a town and unloading a six-foot long Votes for Woman banner and suitcases heavy with leaflets and buttons:

We make for the nearest drug store, deposit all our luggage in one corner, and to compensate for its storage, all of us are duty bound to buy sodas . . . While we drink, the drug clerk is cross-examined as to where the best audience can be collected, time of trolleys, hotel for the night, factories and mills in town, number of employees, men or women, union or non-union. . . Then our leaflets are unpacked, our

42. Jennie Loitman Barron, *Jewish Women's Archive*; <https://www.radcliffe.harvard.edu/schlesinger-library/blog/freedom-all>

43. Margaret Foley, Folder 3, WRC-SL.

44. Park, Folder 95, WRC-SL.

flag erected, we borrow a Moxie box from the drug clerk and proceed to the busiest corner of the town square.

The speaker might address her initial remarks to “the air, three assorted dogs, six kids, and two loafers.” As the others distributed handbills, the audience would increase from “25 to 500, according to the time and place.”⁴⁵ At each stop, the activists recruited supporters to establish local headquarters and carry on the work.

Press reports of the trolley tour were largely positive. Local papers described the speakers as attractive in appearance, refined, intelligent, and able to command the attention of mostly male audiences. Alice Stone Blackwell reprinted these accolades for the *Woman's Journal's* national readership. The trolley tour ended with a large meeting held on Boston Common that was attended by 2,000.⁴⁶

Foley, meanwhile, addressed factory workers during their noon break and attended union meetings in the evenings. She had a special rapport with working-class women, to whom she appealed as both workers and homemakers. On the one hand, she argued that only the ballot would improve working conditions. On the other, she insisted that mothers must have a voice in selecting those officials who made sure that milk and water were pure, meat and canned goods were not poisonous, clothing was not insect infested, and parks and playgrounds were safe.⁴⁷

The suffrage movement also continued its outreach to society women. Alva Belmont hosted a NAWSA meeting and fundraiser at Marble House, her magnificent summer villa in Newport, Rhode Island. For the event, she ordered dinnerware imprinted with “Votes for Women.” Honored guests included ninety-one-year-old Julia Ward Howe. Susan Fitzgerald and Margaret Foley were also part of the Massachusetts contingent.⁴⁸

The finale of the 1909 campaign season was Emmeline Pankhurst's visit to Boston in October, the initial stop on her first U.S. tour. Alice Stone Blackwell used the *Woman's Journal* to allay concern that Pankhurst's “militancy” would harm recent efforts to broaden suffrage's appeal. Stone Blackwell explained that the WSPU had heckled politicians and disrupted government meetings only after women were denied the ability to deliver petitions to and meet with government officials. “Nine-

45. Luscomb, Folder 635, WRC-SL; WJ, 28-August-1909.

46. WJ, 28-August-1909.

47. Foley MC 404: Folder 55, WRC-SL.

48. WJ, 28-August-1909.

tenths of so-called militant tactics have been neither illegal nor violent, and might be used in this country with great advantage,” she remarked.⁴⁹

When Pankhurst arrived, she was escorted from South Station in a procession of automobiles decorated in the colors of the two movements: yellow for NAWSA and purple, white, and green for the WSPU. Speaking to an audience of 2,000 at Tremont Temple, she noted that while her tactics might not be polite, neither were those of the Boston patriots who threw British tea into the harbor. Delightedly, the *Woman's Journal* reported that applause at the close of her remarks was “most enthusiastic.”⁵⁰

Inez Haynes wrote to Park, who was still abroad, that “the movement, which when we got into it had about as much energy as a dying kitten, is now a big, virile, threatening, wonderful thing.” It was, she added, “actually fashionable.”⁵¹ NAWSA sought to harness this new vitality; it held a symposium on open-air techniques at its 1910 convention, and the *Woman's Journal* published Susan Fitzgerald's remarks to share with a national audience.⁵²

During the warm weather months of 1910, Massachusetts suffragists held large numbers of open-air meetings at town commons, factories, and street corners. They obtained a storefront on Tremont Street that served literature and speakers along with lunch and afternoon tea.⁵³ As they campaigned, suffragists developed great camaraderie. Trolley tours and other forms of campaigning were liberating – and fun -- for women who travelled without male escorts.⁵⁴

Automobiles permitted even greater freedom. The suffrage movement used cars for transportation, but also as “public platform, object for ritual decoration, and emblem of the cause of women's emancipation.”⁵⁵ Some campaigners experimented with even bolder techniques. In Lawrence, Foley rose in a hot air balloon and showered rainbow-colored literature upon the crowd. In Brockton, suffragists

49. WJ, 30-October-1909.

50. WJ, 30-October-1909.

51. Graham, 54.

52. WJ, 30-April-1910.

53. Park, Folder 95. WRC-SL.

54. Author's conversation with historian Susan Ware.

55. Scharff, Virginia. *Taking the Wheel: Women and the Coming of the Motor Age* (U. Michigan Press 1991) at 79.

joined a circus parade in a decorated wagon. Such high-profile stunts assured a steady stream of press coverage.⁵⁶

BESAGG also created the Woman Suffrage Party, which was not a traditional political party but rather a vehicle to reach, recruit, and organize women who resided in Boston. Modeled after a similar undertaking in New York, the ambitious goal was to reach every voting-age woman in the city and identify her as pro-suffrage, anti-suffrage, or indifferent. Those identifying as supporters were asked to join the Woman Suffrage Party, whose tightly organized structure included ward chairs and precinct captains. The hope was that pro-suffrage members would influence their husbands, sons, brothers, and fathers.⁵⁷

This method was piloted in Boston's Ward 8, where many Jewish and Italian families lived. Urban canvassing was another new adventure for most suffragists. "It took some sense of duty, some devotion to our cause, to push us through the first unguarded front door, up the dim and unattractive staircase, to knock at [a] door on the first shabby landing," Susan Fitzgerald wrote in a BESAGG Annual Report. When the door was opened, "probably the woman who answered knew no English . . . No matter, you did as well as you could, the children, who have learned English, helped; the Yiddish and Italian flyers helped." Best of all, "the women, as soon as they knew what it was all about, proved so kindly, so approachable, so open-minded and responsive to the call of fair play and their children's welfare."⁵⁸

These door-to-door efforts were followed by postcards in several languages inviting women to attend public meetings. The first one, held in a ward room in May 1910, was a resounding success. Approximately 1,000 women attended. They represented at least "four or five nationalities" and spoke several languages, including Italian and Yiddish, reported the *Boston Globe*. All were, the article added, "hardworking, serious women" who listened closely to all that was said. Speakers addressed the crowd in several languages from a platform decorated with American flags and Votes for Women banners.⁵⁹

Park returned to Boston at the end of the summer of 1910 and resumed her leadership of BESAGG. She also lectured regularly about her travels. Discussing women's experiences in other nations, she

56. WJ, 12-Nov.-1910. Foley, Folder 72, WRC-SL. Luscomb, MC 394:Folder 12, WRC-SL.

57. Park folder 95, WRC-SL.

58. *Id.*

59. *Globe*, 17-May-1910.

believed, helped to draw in audiences of the curious but not yet committed. Demonstrating increased attention to woman suffrage, the *Boston Globe* ran a large feature article describing her travels.⁶⁰ Upon Park's return, Mary Hutcheson Page orchestrated some personnel shifts. Park succeeded Alice Stone Blackwell as chair of the board of MWSA, so the older woman could focus her efforts on the *Woman's Journal*, which moved into new quarters on Boylston Street in the new and thriving Back Bay neighborhood of Boston. (After her father's death in 1909, she was the sole editor of the paper.) Fitzgerald became the executive secretary of MWSA; the previous year, she had been elected to succeed Stone Blackwell as NAWSA's recording secretary.⁶¹

The suffrage movement received a big lift on November 8, 1910, when Washington ended the long drought and became the first state to enfranchise women since Idaho in 1896. Suffragists hoped momentum from this victory would aid the vote in California, scheduled for the following year.

During 1911, Massachusetts suffragists continued their efforts. They canvassed additional Boston wards and enrolled nearly three thousand more women in the Woman Suffrage Party. Park established street corner amateur nights, where women new to public speaking would stand on corners and announce "why they want to vote and why they believe they have the right to vote and why they are determined that they will vote." Luscomb and other "newsies" sold the *Woman's Journal* on busy Boston street corners and subway stations in another effort to attract new subscribers and attention.⁶²

Significantly, there was now a public show of support for woman suffrage among men. The Massachusetts Men's League for Woman Suffrage, modeled after a New York league, was created on April 29, 1910, with Francis Jackson Garrison, son of abolitionist William Lloyd Garrison, serving on the executive committee. Soon, the *Woman's Journal* reported its delight that "the officers and members of the Men's League for Woman Suffrage are taking a more and more active part in the work, with both voice and pen."⁶³

Louis Brandeis was among the notable Massachusetts men who became public supporters. In 1908, the Jewish lawyer won fame by persuading the United States Supreme Court to uphold an Oregon law

60. *Globe*, 12-March-1911.

61. Maud Wood Park, Folder 21, WRC-SL.

62. *Globe*, 1-October-1911; *WJ*, 12-Nov.1910; Luscomb, 394: Folder 212, WRC-SL.

63. *WJ*, 26-February-1910, 23-December-1911, 30-March-1912, 5-October-1912.

restricting the number of hours women could work in laundries. Earlier in his career, Brandeis opposed woman suffrage, but his opinion had changed. He became convinced that “no class or section of the community is so wise or so just that it can safely be trusted to govern well other classes or sections.”⁶⁴

On October 10, 1911, the male voters of California narrowly approved an amendment to the state constitution enfranchising women. Ecstatic suffragists held a victory celebration at Faneuil Hall. Park exclaimed, “I’m just standing on my head with joy!” The nation’s suffrage constellation now had six stars.⁶⁵

Later that fall, Pankhurst returned to the United States. Since her earlier visit, the English suffrage movement had entered a darker phase. On “Black Friday,” November 18, 1910, police assaulted numerous suffragettes when they protested Parliament’s refusal to consider a bill that would have extended the vote to property-owning women. Shortly thereafter, Pankhurst’s younger sister, Mary Jane Clarke, was arrested for window-smashing. When her demand to be treated as a political prisoner was denied, Clarke went on a hunger strike. Prison officials retaliated by force-feeding her, a harrowing ordeal. She was released after serving one month in prison, but died three days later.

During this visit, Pankhurst again spoke at Tremont Temple. Sharing a platform with Alice Stone Blackwell and Maud Wood Park, Pankhurst observed that the United States now had a “thoroughly alive” suffrage movement. She also was scheduled to speak at Harvard, at a lecture sponsored by the Harvard Men’s League for Woman Suffrage. When the resistant Harvard administration refused to permit use of a university-owned building, Pankhurst spoke at nearby Brattle Hall. Stone Blackwell deemed the visit a resounding success, writing that the lectures had done more to arouse interest in the suffrage movement than anything else in the United States.⁶⁶

Though very busy with their home state efforts, Massachusetts activists also continued to play important national and even international roles. Pauline Agassiz Shaw anonymously provided substantial funds to NAWSA; these donations permitted president Anna Howard Shaw (no relation) to pay organizers to travel to Arizona, Kansas, Oregon,

64. *Muller v Oregon*, 208 U.S. 412 (1908). Brandeis, Louis. Speech on Suffrage at Tremont Temple, October 12, 1915.

65. WJ, 14-October-1911; Globe, 13-October-1911, 17-October-1911.

66. Pankhurst, 171; *The Harvard Crimson*, 2-December-1911, 7-December-1911; WJ, 9-December-1911.

Wisconsin, Michigan, North Dakota, Montana, Ohio, and Nevada.⁶⁷ BESAGG, likely with funds donated entirely or largely by Pauline Agassiz Shaw, sponsored Luscomb and Foley to travel to England to study the English suffrage movement and to Sweden to attend the International Woman Suffrage Alliance Convention. Park, Luscomb, Foley, Fitzgerald, and others also campaigned extensively in other states, such as Ohio and Michigan, where voters would soon consider referenda. Luscomb additionally spent one week in Richmond, Virginia where, she reported, southern suffragists sought her expertise, but “at the same time couldn’t bear to be told anything by a damn Yankee.”⁶⁸

While these years were filled with progress, suffrage opponents had not disappeared into the sunset. Conservative remonstrants were as determined as ever to uphold the status quo. The *Remonstrance* had shifted from an annual to a quarterly publication schedule in 1907 and now represented suffrage opponents in seven other states. Remonstrants presented familiar arguments. They claimed that the suffrage movement “confused” the functions of men and women to the detriment of domestic life; reform-minded women could accomplish their goals most effectively if they remained removed from partisan battles; and it was “undemocratic” for suffragists to demand that the burden of politics be thrust upon women until a majority of women demonstrated that they desired the ballot.

Deep opposition also remained among many working-class rank and file, despite union leaders’ alliance with the suffrage movement. Many workers remained wedded to traditional gender roles and feared that women workers would drive wages downward. The Catholic community’s leading newspaper, the *Pilot*, continued to be vehemently anti-suffrage. Anti-prohibition forces also continued to oppose suffrage.

Despite continued challenges, 1911 marked a turning point. Growing numbers of Massachusetts state legislators now favored fully enfranchising women. The strong alliance between Democratic politicians and labor leaders led a majority of delegates at a state Democratic convention to endorse woman suffrage. The Republican Party was nearly evenly split, reflecting its continued division. Displaying new confidence, MWSA sent men seeking office a questionnaire regarding their views on woman suffrage. The *Boston Globe* reported that candidates were “beginning to believe this to be an issue which must be treated seriously, and that his position on the matter may mean his election

67. Johnson, 67.

68. Luscomb, Folder 635, MC: 394, Folder 212, WRC-SL.

or failure to secure office.”⁶⁹ During the 1911 gubernatorial campaign, Margaret Foley tailed Republican candidate Louis Frothingham, who refused to support woman suffrage, and who lost to Democratic incumbent Eugene Foss.⁷⁰ While his loss may have been for other reasons, Foley’s acts led to additional public attention. Though many challenges remained, Bay State suffragists were optimistic as 1912 began. They had good reason to believe that the suffrage tide would soon cross the Mississippi River and surge east.

69. *Globe*, 15-October-1911.

70. Foss was not a typical Democrat. He was a former Republican who broke with the party over tariffs.